heat transport in ill-condensed matter

Stefano Baroni Scuola Internazionale Superiore di Studi Avanzati Trieste — Italy



Frontiers in Thermal and Electronic Transport in Materials: a Tribute to Nicola Bonini, King's College London, April 11-12, 2024





disclaimer



what heat transport is all about



heat flows from warmth to coolth as time flows from the past to the future



what heat transport is all about



Fourier Law







what heat transport is all about



Fourier Law

Green-Kubo





 $\langle \boldsymbol{J}(t) \cdot \boldsymbol{J}(0) \rangle dt$



 $\boldsymbol{J} = \frac{d}{dt} \sum_{n} \boldsymbol{R}_{i} \boldsymbol{e}_{i}$ $=\sum_{i} \left(\dot{\boldsymbol{R}}_{i} e_{i} + \boldsymbol{R}_{i} \dot{\boldsymbol{e}}_{i} \right)$









 $J = \sum_{i} \left(\dot{R}_{i} e_{i} + R_{i} \dot{e}_{i} \right)$ $= \sum_{i} R_{i}^{\circ} \dot{e}_{i} + \frac{d}{dt} \sum_{i} u_{i} e_{i}$

$$\boldsymbol{R}_i = \boldsymbol{R}_i^\circ + \boldsymbol{u}_i$$









 $J_{\alpha} \approx \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij\beta\gamma} \left(R_{i\alpha}^{\circ} - R_{j\alpha}^{\circ} \right) \Phi_{i\beta}^{j\gamma} u_{i\beta} \dot{u}_{j\gamma}$



 $\mathbf{J} = \sum_{i} \mathbf{R}_{i}^{\circ} \dot{\mathbf{e}}_{i}$

 $e_{i} \approx \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha} \dot{u}_{i\alpha}^{2} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha\beta, j \neq i} \Phi_{i\alpha}^{j\beta} u_{i\alpha} u_{j\beta}$

 $J_{\alpha} \approx \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij\beta\gamma} \left(R_{i\alpha}^{\circ} - R_{j\alpha}^{\circ} \right) \Phi_{i\beta}^{j\gamma} u_{i\beta} \dot{u}_{j\gamma}$



 $\boldsymbol{J} = \sum_{i} \boldsymbol{R}_{i}^{\circ} \dot{\boldsymbol{e}}_{i}$

 $e_{i} \approx \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha} \dot{u}_{i\alpha}^{2} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha\beta, j \neq i} \Phi_{i\alpha}^{j\beta} u_{i\alpha} u_{j\beta}$

 $J_{\alpha} \approx \frac{1}{2} \sum_{ij\beta\gamma} \left(R_{i\alpha}^{\circ} - R_{j\alpha}^{\circ} \right) \Phi_{i\beta}^{j\gamma} u_{i\beta} \dot{u}_{j\gamma}$ $=\sum v_{nm}^{\alpha}\sqrt{\omega_{n}\omega_{m}}q_{n}p_{m}$ nm



 $\boldsymbol{J} = \sum_{i} \boldsymbol{R}_{i}^{\circ} \dot{\boldsymbol{e}}_{i}$

 $e_i \approx \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha} \dot{u}_{i\alpha}^2 + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha\beta, j \neq i} \Phi_{i\alpha}^{j\beta} u_{i\alpha} u_{j\beta}$

nm

 $\frac{1}{2\sqrt{\omega_n\omega_m}} \sum_{ij\beta\gamma} \frac{R_{i\alpha}^{\circ} - R_{j\alpha}^{\circ}}{\sqrt{M_iM_j}} \Phi_{i\beta}^{j\gamma} e_n^{i\beta} e_m^{j\gamma} \qquad \begin{array}{l} \text{first real-space moments} \\ \text{of the inter-atomic force} \\ \text{constants} \end{array}$ v_{nm}^{α}



 $\mathbf{J} = \sum_{i} \mathbf{R}_{i}^{\circ} \dot{\mathbf{e}}_{i}$

 $e_{i} \approx \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha} \dot{u}_{i\alpha}^{2} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha\beta, j \neq i} \Phi_{i\alpha}^{j\beta} u_{i\alpha} u_{j\beta}$

 $J_{\alpha} \approx \frac{1}{2} \sum_{\alpha} \left(R_{i\alpha}^{\circ} - R_{j\alpha}^{\circ} \right) \Phi_{i\beta}^{j\gamma} u_{i\beta} \dot{u}_{j\gamma}$

 $= \sum v_{nm}^{\alpha} \sqrt{\omega_n \omega_m} q_n p_m$

 $J_{\alpha} = \sum v_{nm}^{\alpha} \sqrt{\omega_n \omega_m} q_n p_m$ nm

 $\kappa \propto \int_{0}^{\infty} dt \int dq_{\circ} dp_{\circ} \int (q_{t}p_{t}) \int (q_{\circ}p_{\circ}) e^{-\beta H(q_{\circ}p_{\circ})}$ 4-th order polynomial Gaussian



 $J_{\alpha} = \sum v_{nm}^{\alpha} \sqrt{\omega_n \omega_m} q_n p_m$ nm

 $\kappa \propto \int_0^\infty dt \int dq_\circ dp_\circ \int (q_t p_t) J(q_\circ p_\circ) e^{-\beta H(q_\circ p_\circ)}$ 4-th order polynomial Gaussian Gaussian integral \mapsto Wick theorem





$$\kappa \propto \int_0^\infty dt \int dq_\circ dp_\sigma$$
Gaussian





 $D_{\circ} \int (q_t p_t) \int (q_{\circ} p_{\circ}) e^{-\beta H(q_{\circ} p_{\circ})}$ 4-th order polynomial Gaussian an integral \mapsto Wick theorem

 $\kappa = \infty$



$$\kappa \propto \int_0^\infty dt \int dq_\circ dp_\sigma$$
Gaussian





 $p_{\circ} \int (q_t p_t) \int (q_{\circ} p_{\circ}) e^{-\beta H(q_{\circ} p_{\circ})}$ 4-th order polynomial Gaussian an integral \mapsto Wick theorem

 $\omega \mapsto \omega + i\gamma$ $\kappa < \infty$



$$\kappa \propto \int_0^\infty dt \int dq_\circ dp_\sigma$$
Gaussian





 $p_{\circ} \int (q_t p_t) \int (q_{\circ} p_{\circ}) e^{-\beta H(q_{\circ} p_{\circ})}$ 4-th order polynomial Gaussian an integral \mapsto Wick theorem

 $\omega \mapsto \omega + i\gamma$ $\kappa < \infty$









 $v_{nm}^{\alpha} = \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\omega_n\omega_m}} \sum_{i,i\beta\gamma} \frac{\mathcal{K}_{i\alpha}^{\circ} - \mathcal{K}_{j\alpha}^{\circ}}{\sqrt{M_i M_j}} \Phi_{i\beta}^{j\gamma} e_n^{i\beta} e_m^{j\gamma}$

 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$







 $au_{nm}^{\circ} = rac{1}{(\gamma_n + 1)^{\circ}}$ $c_{nm} = \frac{\hbar\omega_m\omega_r}{\tau}$



 $v_{nm}^{\alpha} = \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\omega_n\omega_m}} \sum_{i,i\beta\gamma} \frac{R_{i\alpha}^{\circ} - R_{j\alpha}^{\circ}}{\sqrt{M_i M_i}} \Phi_{i\beta}^{j\gamma} e_n^{i\beta} e_m^{j\gamma}$

 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$

$$\frac{\gamma_n + \gamma_m}{\gamma_m)^2 + (\omega_n - \omega_m)^2}$$

$$\frac{n}{\omega_n} \frac{n(\omega_n) - n(\omega_m)}{\omega_m - \omega_n}$$







 $au_{nm}^{\circ} = \frac{1}{(\gamma_n + 1)^{\circ}}$ $c_{nm} = \frac{\hbar\omega_m\omega_r}{\tau}$



 $v_{nm}^{\alpha} = \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\omega_n\omega_m}} \sum_{i,i\beta\alpha'} \frac{\mathcal{K}_{i\alpha}^{\circ} - \mathcal{K}_{j\alpha}^{\circ}}{\sqrt{M_i M_i}} \Phi_{i\beta}^{j\gamma} e_n^{i\beta} e_m^{j\gamma}$

 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$

$$\frac{\gamma_n + \gamma_m}{\gamma_m)^2 + (\omega_n - \omega_m)^2}$$
$$\frac{n}{m} \frac{n(\omega_n) - n(\omega_m)}{\omega_m - \omega_n}$$

small γ $pprox \pi \delta(\omega_n - \omega_m)$ $\approx k_B \left(\frac{\hbar\omega_n}{k_B T}\right)^2 \frac{1}{\left(e^{\frac{\hbar\omega_n}{k_B T}} - 1\right)^2}$

 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$ nm





17

$$\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$$

$$\lim_{in \text{ crystals}} v_{nn'} = v_n(\boldsymbol{q}) \delta_{\nu\nu'} \delta_{\boldsymbol{q}\boldsymbol{q}'}$$

$$\downarrow$$

$$\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{\boldsymbol{q}\nu} c_{\nu}(\boldsymbol{q}) v_{\nu}(\boldsymbol{q})^2 \tau_{\nu}(\boldsymbol{q}) \quad \text{(BTE)}$$





17



3853 (2019).



and disordered solids, Nat. Phys. 15, 809–813 (2019).

17









 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$

quantum QHGK









 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$

quantum QHGK

 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$ nm



$$\kappa'(\omega) = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} \delta(\omega - \omega_n) c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$$
$$\kappa(\omega) = \int_0^{\omega} \kappa'(\omega') d\omega'$$



 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$ nm



$$\kappa'(\omega) = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} \delta(\omega - \omega_n) c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$$
$$\kappa(\omega) = \int_0^{\omega} \kappa'(\omega') d\omega'$$





 $\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$ nm



$$\kappa'(\omega) = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} \delta(\omega - \omega_n) c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^{\circ}$$
$$\kappa(\omega) = \int_0^{\omega} \kappa'(\omega') d\omega'$$







$$\begin{split} S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) &= -\frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im} G(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) \\ &= \frac{1}{\pi} \sum_{n} \frac{\gamma_{n}}{(\omega_{n}-\omega)^{2}+\gamma_{n}^{2}} |\langle e_{n} | \boldsymbol{q} \rangle|^{2} \end{split}$$



$$S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) = -\frac{1}{\pi} \operatorname{Im} G(\boldsymbol{q},\omega)$$

= $\frac{1}{\pi} \sum_{n} \frac{\gamma_{n}}{(\omega_{n} - \omega)^{2} + \gamma_{n}^{2}} |\langle e_{n} | \boldsymbol{q} \rangle|^{2}$
= $\frac{A(\boldsymbol{q})}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^{2}}{(\omega - \Omega(\boldsymbol{q}))^{2} + \Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})}$



$$\begin{split} S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) &= -\frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im} G(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) \\ &= \frac{1}{\pi} \sum_{n} \frac{\gamma_{n}}{(\omega_{n}-\omega)^{2}+\gamma_{n}^{2}} |\langle e_{n} | \boldsymbol{q} \rangle|^{2} \\ &= \frac{A(\boldsymbol{q})}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^{2}}{\left(\omega-\underbrace{\Omega(\boldsymbol{q})}{}\right)^{2}+\underbrace{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})}_{\approx a\omega^{2}+b\omega^{4}} \end{split}$$



$$\begin{split} S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) &= -\frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im} G(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) \\ &= \frac{1}{\pi} \sum_{n} \frac{\gamma_{n}}{(\omega_{n} - \omega)^{2} + \gamma_{n}^{2}} |\langle e_{n} | \boldsymbol{q} \rangle|^{2} \\ &= \frac{A(\boldsymbol{q})}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^{2}}{\left(\omega - \underbrace{\Omega(\boldsymbol{q})}{2}\right)^{2} + \underbrace{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})}_{2}} \\ &\approx cq \qquad \approx a\omega^{2} + b\omega^{4} \\ &\text{anharmonicity} \qquad \text{disorder} \\ & (\text{blue sky}) \end{split}$$



Dynamical Structure Factor

$$\begin{split} S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) &= -\frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im} G(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) \\ &= \frac{1}{\pi} \sum_{n} \frac{\gamma_{n}}{(\omega_{n} - \omega)^{2} + \gamma_{n}^{2}} |\langle e_{n} | \boldsymbol{q} \rangle|^{2} \\ &= \frac{A(\boldsymbol{q})}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^{2}}{\left(\omega - \underbrace{\Omega(\boldsymbol{q})}{2}\right)^{2} + \underbrace{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})}_{2}} \\ &\approx cq \qquad \approx a\omega^{2} + b\omega^{4} \\ &\text{anharmonicity} \qquad \text{disorder} \\ &\text{(blue sk)} \end{split}$$



Lanczos recursion



Dynamical Structure Factor

$$\begin{split} S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) &= -\frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im} G(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) \\ &= \frac{1}{\pi} \sum_{n} \frac{\gamma_{n}}{(\omega_{n} - \omega)^{2} + \gamma_{n}^{2}} |\langle e_{n} | \boldsymbol{q} \rangle|^{2} \\ &= \frac{A(\boldsymbol{q})}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^{2}}{\left(\omega - \underbrace{\Omega(\boldsymbol{q})}{2}\right)^{2} + \underbrace{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})}_{2}} \\ &\approx cq \qquad \approx a\omega^{2} + b\omega^{4} \\ &\text{anharmonicity} \qquad \text{disorder} \\ & \text{(blue sky)} \end{split}$$



Lanczos recursion

$$S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) = -\frac{1}{\pi} \operatorname{Im} \left\langle \boldsymbol{q} \left| \left((\omega + i\epsilon)^2 - D \right)^{-1} \right| \boldsymbol{q} \right\rangle$$
$$= -\frac{1}{\pi} \frac{1}{(\omega + i\epsilon)^2 - a_0 - \frac{b_1^2}{(\omega + i\epsilon)^2 - a_1 - \frac{b_2^2}{(\omega + i\epsilon)^2 - a_1 - \frac$$

•

Dynamical Structure Factor

$$\begin{split} S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) &= -\frac{1}{\pi} \mathrm{Im} G(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) \\ &= \frac{1}{\pi} \sum_{n} \frac{\gamma_{n}}{(\omega_{n} - \omega)^{2} + \gamma_{n}^{2}} |\langle e_{n} | \boldsymbol{q} \rangle|^{2} \\ &= \frac{A(\boldsymbol{q})}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^{2}}{\left(\omega - \underbrace{\Omega(\boldsymbol{q})}{2}\right)^{2} + \underbrace{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})}_{2}} \\ &\approx cq \qquad \approx a\omega^{2} + b\omega^{4} \\ &\text{anharmonicity} \qquad \text{disorder} \\ & \text{(blue sky)} \end{split}$$



Lanczos recursion

$$S(q,\omega) = -\frac{1}{\pi} \operatorname{Im} \left\langle q \left| \left((\omega + i\epsilon)^2 - D \right)^{-1} \right| q \right\rangle \\ = -\frac{1}{\pi} \frac{1}{(\omega + i\epsilon)^2 - a_0} - \frac{b_1^2}{(\omega + i\epsilon)^2 - a_1 - \frac{b_2^2}{(\omega + i\epsilon)^2 - a_1 - \frac{b_2^2}$$

$$\begin{aligned} |\xi_0\rangle &= |\boldsymbol{q}\rangle \\ b_0|\xi_{-1}\rangle &= 0 \\ a_n &= \langle \xi_n | D | \xi_n \rangle \\ a_{n+1}|\xi_{n+1}\rangle &= (D-a_n)|\xi_n\rangle - b_n |\xi_{n-1}\rangle \\ b_{n+1} &= \langle \xi_n | D | \xi_{n+1} \rangle \end{aligned}$$

dozens of thousands of atoms easily manageable



Dynamical Structure Factor $S(q, \omega) = \frac{A(q)}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(q)^2}{(\omega - \Omega(q))^2 + \Gamma(q)^2}$





Dynamical Structure Factor $S(\boldsymbol{q},\omega) = \frac{A(\boldsymbol{q})}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^2}{\left(\omega - \Omega(\boldsymbol{q})\right)^2 + \Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^2}$

Heat conductivity

$$\kappa = \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm \in P} c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^\circ + \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm \notin P} c_{nm} (v_{nm})^2 \tau_{nm}^\circ$$





 T_{nm}°

Dynamical Structure Factor $S(\boldsymbol{q}, \omega) = \frac{A(\boldsymbol{q})}{\pi} \frac{\Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^2}{\left(\omega - \Omega(\boldsymbol{q})\right)^2 + \Gamma(\boldsymbol{q})^2}$

Heat conductivity







hydrodynamic extrapolation







 $\kappa^{AF} = \frac{\pi}{V} \sum C_n (v_{nm})^2 \delta(\omega_n - \omega_m)$ nm







$$\kappa^{AF} = \frac{\pi}{V} \sum_{nm} C_n (v_{nm})^2 \delta(\omega_n - \omega_m)$$
$$\approx \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} C_n (v_{nm})^2 \frac{\eta}{(\omega_n - \omega_m)^2 + \omega_m}$$

$$\kappa_P^{AF} = \frac{1}{2\pi^2 c} \int_{\omega_{min}}^{\omega_P} \frac{\omega^2 C(\omega)}{b\omega^4 + \eta} d\omega$$
$$\underbrace{\frac{2\pi c}{L}}$$



 $\cdot \eta^2$

$$\kappa^{AF} = \frac{\pi}{V} \sum_{nm} C_n (v_{nm})^2 \delta(\omega_n - \omega_m)$$
$$\approx \frac{1}{V} \sum_{nm} C_n (v_{nm})^2 \frac{\eta}{(\omega_n - \omega_m)^2 + \omega_m}$$

$$\kappa_P^{AF} = \frac{1}{2\pi^2 c} \int_{\omega_{min}}^{\omega_P} \frac{\omega^2 C(\omega)}{b\omega^4 + \eta} d\omega$$
$$\underbrace{\frac{2\pi c}{L}}$$





 η^2







sound damping at low frequency

harmonic damping, $\Gamma(\omega)$





- an $\omega^4 \rightarrow \omega^2$ crossover is observed in the sound damping coefficient, as estimated from the harmonic DSF
- $\omega_{XO}[Si] > \omega_{XO}[SiC] > \omega_{XO}[SiO_2]$
- experimentally, one observes two frequency crossovers, $\omega^2 \to \omega^4 \to \omega^2$:
 - the first, temperature-dependent, is due to the weakness of anharmonic effects at low temperature;
 - the second, temperature-independent, is possibly due to LT mixing determined by the line broadening itself

conclusions

- the Allen-Feldman harmonic model in glasses
- hydrodynamic arguments
- which can inadvertently mimic boundary scattering in experiments
- anharmonic effects are essential to predict a finite conductivity in bulk glasses



• the combination of the Green-Kubo theory of linear response with the (quasi-) harmonic approximation for lattice vibrations allows us to bridge and naturally extend the Boltzmann-Peierls kinetic theory of heat transport in crystals with

• results from computer simulations performed on finite glass models can be easily and accurately extrapolated to the thermodynamic limit, leveraging

• the Allen-Feldman harmonic model of heat transport in glasses is inevitably affected by an infrared singularity when the thermodynamic limit is performed properly; a finite conductivity can only result from finite-size finite effects,

thanks to:





Paolo Pegolo (EPFL)

npj | computational materials

Hydrodynamic finite-size scaling of the thermal conductivity in glasses

<u>Alfredo Fiorentino</u> [™], <u>Paolo Pegolo</u> & <u>Stefano Baroni</u>

npj Computational Materials 9, Article number: 157 (2023) Cite this article



Enrico Drigo (SISSA)



Alfredo Fiorentino (SISSA)

 $\exists r \times i V > cond-mat > arXiv:2307.09370$

Condensed Matter > Disordered Systems and Neural Networks

[Submitted on 14 Jul 2023]

Unearthing the foundational role of anharmonicity in heat transport in glasses

Alfredo Fiorentino, Enrico Drigo, Stefano Baroni, Paolo Pegolo



supported by: Centro Nazionale di Ricerca in HPC, **Big Data and Quantum Computing**















farewell, Nicola!

thanks to Nicola Marzari for sharing his photo archive with me

